**For completion *after* the oral examination.**

**Confidentiality:** Please note that the Part II form will be provided to the student in its entirety.

**Please complete the form in typescript or block capitals**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Student:** |  | **UUN:** | S |
| **Title of thesis\*:** |  |
| **Degree sought:** |  | **Oral Exam date:** |  |
| **School:** |  |
| **Name of external examiner (1)** |  |
| **Name of internal examiner (1)** |  |
| Name of external examiner (2) (if required) |  |
| **Name of non-examining chair** (if applicable) |  |
| **Name of observer(s)** (if present) |  |

**The completed report may be returned (within two weeks of the oral examination) as an email attachment to the College at:**

*[College email address]*

(emailed reports need not be signed but should be sent from institutional email address)

(See [Postgraduate Assessment Regulations for Research Degrees](https://uoe.sharepoint.com/%3Ab%3A/s/PolicyRepository/EeQtUAPnwZtCoJLwgGOSO6IBJgr_bPxy8GGd0j-agREbLA)

And the [Degree Regulations and Programmes of Study](http://www.drps.ed.ac.uk/) (DRPS))

**Report to the College Committee**

**Joint recommendation**

|  |
| --- |
| **Please indicate your joint recommendation (refer to** [**Postgraduate Assessment Regulations for Research Degrees**](https://uoe.sharepoint.com/%3Ab%3A/s/PolicyRepository/EeQtUAPnwZtCoJLwgGOSO6IBJgr_bPxy8GGd0j-agREbLA)**). Please place an “x” or tick in the appropriate box.****Available options: a - f** |
| **a** | **Award PhD/Doctorate.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the award of the doctoral degree as laid down in the University’s Degree Regulations and Programmes of Study(see [www.drps.ed.ac.uk/](http://www.drps.ed.ac.uk/)) as appropriate. No further changes can be made to the thesis after examination; or |  |
| **Student Action:** finalise hard-copy thesis submission for doctorate degree**Re-examination**: None |
| **b** | **Minor** **Corrections Needed.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the award of the degree except that editorial corrections are required or stated minor weaknesses as identified by the examiners must be remedied. Examiners may only request corrections to the critical review. In the opinion of the examiners, the student will be able to remedy these without undertaking any further original research. The corrections to the thesis must be completed within three months and are subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Make specified corrections within three months and submit to internal examiner**Re-examination**: Corrections to be certified by Internal Examiner(s)Has the External Examiner requested to certify corrections? (delete as appropriate)  | YES/NO |
| **c** | **Additional Oral Examination Needed.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree, or satisfies the requirements except for stated minor weaknesses, but the student’s oral defence of the thesis has been inadequate in specified respects. The student is required to undergo further assessment, written, oral or practical, and make any corrections to the thesis within a specified period\* of not more than four months. Examiners may only request corrections to the critical review. The degree is awarded subject to the student achieving a satisfactory standard in the further oral examination and subject to certification of the corrections by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests); or |  |
| **Student Action:** Re-sit viva and undergo further written or practical assessment if required**Re-examination**: Further oral examination of original thesisHas the External Examiner has requested to certify corrections? (delete as appropriate) | YES/NO |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **d** | **Additional Work on Thesis Needed - No Oral Re-Examination Needed – Resubmission for PhD by Research Publications.** The thesis needs significant work in order to meet one or more of the requirements for the degree. Examiners may only request corrections to the critical review. The revised thesis must be completed within a further specified period\* of study, which is set by the examiners, and which must not exceed six months. Exceptionally, this period may be extended to a maximum of 12 months with permission from the College. In these cases College may also re-categorise the recommendation to (e) – see below. The thesis is subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or  |  |
| **Student Action:** Complete thesis revision within specified period and submit to internal examiner – no thesis resubmission required**Re-examination**: Revisions to be certified by Internal Examiner(s)Has the External Examiner requested to certify corrections? (delete as appropriate) | YES/NO |
| **e** | **Substantial Work on Thesis and Oral Re-Examination Needed – Resubmission for PhD by Research Publications.** The thesis is substantially inadequate in one or more of the requirements for the degree. Examiners may only request corrections to the critical review. The student ought therefore to be invited to resubmit the thesis for oral examination in a substantially revised form as indicated by the examiners within a further specified period\* of study, which is set by the examiners, which must not exceed 12 months. Exceptionally, this period may be extended to a maximum of 24 months with permission from the College; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Complete substantial revisions and resubmit thesis within specified period**Re-examination**: Oral examination of resubmitted thesis |
| **f** | **Fail.** The thesis is substantially deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these or any other research degree. |  |
| **Student Action:** None**Re-examination**: None |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| \* Specific Period recommended for corrections/re-sit viva by examiners (if applicable) (recommendation c, d or e) | Click here to enter text. |

***If resubmission is recommended, only one copy of the original thesis should be returned to the student. The other should be retained by the Internal Examiner to facilitate checking of revisions when the thesis is resubmitted.***

**Comments made a*fter* the oral examination**

**Examiners are reminded that this (Part II) report will also be made available to the student and their supervisor(s) after ratification by the Committee. If examiners have any concerns about this they should contact the relevant College Postgraduate Office.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Were there any areas of significant disagreement between the examiners in their respective Part I reports?** | YES NO [ ] [ ]  |

|  |
| --- |
| **If YES**, please explain below how these differences were reconciled. If the Examiners are not in agreement (and are therefore completing separate copies of this report), please state below details of the disagreement and, where appropriate, relate them to the preliminary report. |
|  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Please comment on how criticisms made in the initial reports were resolved or reinforced by the student's performance at the oral examination and any further criticisms that arose during the examiners' discussion or in the course of the oral examination.**  |
|  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Date of oral* |  | *Signature(s) of external examiner(s)* |  |
|  |  |  |
| *Signature(s) of internal examiner(s)* |  |
|  |  |
| Student’s name |  |

**Specific criticisms for transmission to the student**

(*to be completed including a comment on the student’s performance at the oral examination*)

If editorial corrections or stated minor deficiencies are recommended, then these should be detailed. If recommendation (f) is made then the main reasons for rejecting the submission for PhD should be given. *Please note that a list of minor corrections may be passed to the student. They will, however, be regarded as* ***recommendations*** *only until ratified by the committee.*

|  |
| --- |
|  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Date of oral* |  | *Signature(s) of external examiner(s)* |  |
|  |  |  |
| *Signature(s) of internal examiner(s)* |  |
|  |  |

**Document control**

|  |
| --- |
| K:\AAPS\D-AcademicAdministration\02-CodesOfPractice,Guidelines&Regulations\24-MainReferencesCopiesPolicies\01-Current\Assessment BOE SCC & Feedback\Forms\PhDbyPublicationExaminerReportPtII  |
| If you require this document in an alternative format please email Academic.Policy@ed.ac.uk  | Date last revised:01.07.2025 |