Examiners are requested to complete the form jointly, including the critique section.

The completed form should be signed by both examiners on the final page and returned

**without delay (within two weeks of the oral examination)**,

as an email attachment to:

**<College email address>**

(emailed reports need not be signed but should be sent from institutional email address)

**Please complete the form in typescript or block capitals.**

**Examiners are reminded that Part I reports can be requested by student and Part II reports are made available to students and their supervisor(s) after ratification by the College.**

**If examiners have any concerns about this they should contact**

**the College Postgraduate Office.**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Student:** |  | | **UUN:** | | S |
| **Title of thesis\*:** |  | | | | |
| **Degree sought:** |  | | | **Oral Exam date:** |  |
| **School:** | |  | | | |
| **Name of external examiner (1)** | |  | | | |
| **Name of internal examiner (1)** | |  | | | |
| Name of external examiner (2) (if required) | |  | | | |
|  | |  | | | |
| **Name of non-examining chair**  (if applicable) | |  | | | |
| **Name of observer(s)** (if present) | |  | | | |

\*Thesis refers to thesis and/or portfolio throughout this form.

**Comments made a*fter* the oral examination**

Please indicate your assessment below by placing an “X” or tick in the appropriate box and adding your comments in the spaces provided. (*The space will expand as required in the electronic version. If using paper, please continue your comments on a separate sheet.)*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Report to the College Committee** | |
| **Were there any areas of significant disagreement between the examiners in their respective Part I reports?** | YES NO |
| **If YES**, please explain below how these differences were reconciled. If the Examiners are not in agreement (and are therefore completing separate copies of this report), please state below details of the disagreement and, where appropriate, relate them to the preliminary report. | |
|  | |

|  |
| --- |
| **Please comment on how criticisms made in the initial reports were resolved or reinforced by the student's performance at the oral examination and any further criticisms that arose during the examiners' discussion or in the course of the oral examination.** |
|  |

**Joint recommendation**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Please indicate your joint recommendation (refer to** [**Postgraduate Assessment Regulations for Research Degrees**](https://uoe.sharepoint.com/:b:/s/PolicyRepository/EeQtUAPnwZtCoJLwgGOSO6IBJgr_bPxy8GGd0j-agREbLA)**). Please place an “x” or tick in the appropriate box.**  **Available options: a - j** | | |
| **a** | **Award PhD/Doctorate.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the award of the doctoral degree as laid down in the University’s Degree Regulations and Programmes of Study(see [www.drps.ed.ac.uk/](http://www.drps.ed.ac.uk/)) as appropriate. No further changes can be made to the thesis after examination; or |  |
| **Student Action:** finalise hard-copy thesis submission for doctorate degree.  **Re-examination**: None | | |
| **b** | **Minor** **Corrections Needed.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the award of the degree except that editorial corrections are required or stated minor weaknesses, as identified by the examiners, must be remedied. In the opinion of the examiners, the student will be able to remedy these without undertaking any further original research. The corrections to the thesis must be completed within three months and are subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or |  |
| Has the External Examiner also requested to certify the corrections? (delete as appropriate) | | YES/  NO |
| **Student Action:** Make specified corrections within three months and submit to internal examiner.  **Re-examination**: Corrections to be certified by Internal Examiner(s) and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests). | |  |
| **c** | **Additional Oral Examination Needed.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree, or satisfies the requirements except for stated minor weaknesses, but the student’s oral defence of the thesis has been inadequate in specified respects. The student is required to undergo further assessment, written, oral or practical, and make any corrections to the thesis within a specified period**\*** of not more than four months. The degree is awarded subject to the student achieving a satisfactory standard in the further oral examination and subject to certification of the corrections by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests); or |  |
| Has the External Examiner also requested to certify the corrections? (delete as appropriate) | | YES/  NO |
| **Student Action:** Re-sit viva and undergo further written or practical assessment if required.  **Re-examination**: Further oral examination of original thesis. | |  |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **d** | **Additional Work on Thesis Needed - No Oral Re-Examination Needed – Resubmission for PhD/Doctorate.** The thesis needs work above and beyond editorial corrections or minor weaknesses in order to meet one or more of the requirements for the degree, and this work may require further supervision. The revised thesis must be completed within a further specified period**\*** of study, which is set by the examiners, and which must not exceed six months. Exceptionally, this period may be extended to a maximum of 12 months with permission from the College. In these cases College may also re-categorise the recommendation to (e) – see below. The thesis is subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner(s) (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or |  |
| Has the External Examiner also requested to certify the corrections? (delete as appropriate) | | YES/  NO |
| **Student Action:** Complete thesis revision within specified period and submit to internal examiner.  **Re-examination**: Revisions to be certified by Internal Examiner(s) and by the External Examiner(s) (where the examiner so requests). | |  |
| **e** | **Substantial Work on Thesis and Oral Re-Examination Needed – Resubmission for PhD/Doctorate.** The thesis is substantially inadequate in one or more of the requirements for the degree. The student ought therefore to be invited to resubmit the thesis for oral examination in a substantially revised form as indicated by the examiners within a further specified period**\*** of study, which is set by the examiners, which must not exceed 12 months. Exceptionally, this period may be extended to a maximum of 24 months with permission from the College; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Complete substantial revisions and resubmit thesis within specified period.  **Re-examination**: Oral examination of resubmitted thesis. | | |
| **f** | **Award MPhil.** The thesis is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the doctoral degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements; but the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Finalise hard-copy thesis submission for MPhil degree.  **Re-examination**: None | | |

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **g** | **Award MPhil following Minor Corrections.** The thesis is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the doctoral degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements. However, the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil except for stated minor corrections in the thesis. The student should be invited to carry out the specified minor corrections as indicated by the examiners. The corrections to the thesis must be completed within three months and are subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or |  |
| Has the External Examiner also requested to certify the corrections? (delete as appropriate) | | YES/  NO |
| **Student Action:** Make specified corrections within three months and submit to internal examiner.  **Re-examination**: Corrections to be certified by Internal Examiner(s) and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests). | |  |
| **h** | **Substantial Work on Thesis Needed before Resubmission and oral examination for MPhil.** The thesis is substantially inadequate in one or more of the requirements for the doctoral degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements. However, the thesis may satisfy the requirements for the degree of MPhil if stated deficiencies in the thesis are remedied. Accordingly, the student should be invited to resubmit the thesis in a substantially revised form as indicated by the examiners for the degree of MPhil. The revisions should be completed within a further period which must not exceed 12 months; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Rectify deficiencies and resubmit thesis within 12 months  **Re-examination**: Oral examination of resubmitted thesis required | | |
| **i** | **Award MSc by Research.** The thesis is substantially deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements or the requirements of the MPhil. However, the work is of sufficient quality to merit the award of MSc by Research; or |  |
| **Student Action:** None  **Re-examination**: None | | |
| **j** | **Fail.** The thesis is substantially deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these or any other research degree requirements.  (Students failing to meet requirements following resubmission under (d), (e) or (h)  may be considered for an exit award.) |  |
| **Student Action**: None  **Re-examination**: None | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| \* Specific Period recommended for corrections/re-sit viva by examiners (recommendation c, d or e)  **It is important to note that any exceptional extension to the period recommended by the examiners will require a concession from the relevant College** |  |
| Has a copy of the thesis with corrections already been sent to student by the examiners? | YES / NO (delete as appropriate) |

***If resubmission is recommended, only one copy of the original thesis should be returned to the student. The other should be retained by the Internal Examiner to facilitate checking of revisions when the thesis is resubmitted.***

**Specific examination critique**

**to be given to the student by the College Committee**

(to be completed including a comment on the student’s performance at the oral examination)

**Please complete the form in typescript or block capitals**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Student:** |  | **UUN:** | | S |
| **Title of thesis\*:** |  | | | |
| **Degree sought:** |  | | **Oral Exam date:** |  |

* The joint report must include any conclusions reached by the examiners as a result of the oral examination, particularly in any areas of concern identified in the individual reports.
* Where editorial corrections or modifications are required these should be specified in the joint report.
* If resubmission is recommended, only one copy of the original thesis should be returned to the student. The other should be retained by the Internal Examiner to facilitate checking of revision when the thesis is resubmitted.
* If the thesis is considered to be substantially deficient, the report should explain in detail which aspects of the thesis require revision to bring it up to the standard required. If the examiners recommend that no degree should be awarded, the main reasons for rejecting the thesis must be given.
* **If examiners pass information to students about recommendations they must make it clear that these are only provisional, as the final decision rests with the Examinations Committee.**

|  |
| --- |
| **Critique to the student: detailing aspects of the thesis that require revision or main reasons for rejecting the thesis** (*The space will expand as required in the electronic version. If using paper, please continue your comments on a separate sheet.)* |
|  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Additional comments for the student: for example suggestions for future publication** (*The space will expand as required in the electronic version. If using paper, please continue your comments on a separate sheet.)* |
|  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of external examiner (1)** |  |
| **Signature of internal examiner (1)** |  |
| (Signature of external examiner (2)) |  |
| **Date:** |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **FOR COLLEGE USE ONLY**  Date received: |

**Document control**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| K:\AAPS\D-AcademicAdministration\02-CodesOfPractice,Guidelines&Regulations\24-MainReferencesCopiesPolicies\01-Current\Assessment BOE SCC & Feedback\Forms\ThesisExaminerReportPtII | |
| If you require this document in an alternative format please email [Academic.Policy@ed.ac.uk](mailto:Academic.Policy@ed.ac.uk) | Date last revised:  01.07.2025 |