**This form should be completed jointly**

Examiners are requested to complete the form jointly and to return it

**without delay (within two weeks of the oral examination)**,

as an email attachment to:

**<College email address>**

(emailed reports need not be signed but will require verification)

**Alternatively, a paper copy may be returned by post to:**

**<College Office address>**

**Please complete the form in typescript or block capitals**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of student:** | Click here to enter text. | **UUN** | SClick here to enter text. |
| **Title of thesis\*:** | Click here to enter text. | | |
| **Degree sought:** | Click here to enter text. | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Date of oral**  **examination:** | Click here to enter a date. |
| **Name of external examiner (1):** | Click here to enter text. |
| **Name of internal examiner (1):** | Click here to enter text. |
| If Required: Name of External Examiner(2): | Click here to enter text. |
| **Name of non-examining chair**  (if applicable) | Click here to enter text. |
| **Name of observer(s)** (if present) | Click here to enter text. |

\*Thesis refers to thesis and/or portfolio throughout this form

**Examiners are reminded that Part II(R) reports may also be requested and made available to students and their supervisor(s) after ratification by the College.**

**If examiners have any concerns about this they should contact**

**the College Postgraduate Office.**

**Comments made *after* the oral examination**

Please indicate your assessment below by placing an “X” or tick in the appropriate box and adding your comments in the spaces provided. (*The space will expand as required in the electronic version. If using paper, please continue your comments on a separate sheet.)*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Report to the College Committee** | |
| **Were there any areas of significant disagreement between the examiners in their respective Part I(R) reports?** | YES NO |
| **If YES**, please explain below how these differences were reconciled. If the Examiners are not in agreement (and are therefore completing separate copies of this report), please state below details of the disagreement and, where appropriate, relate them to the preliminary report. | |
| Click here to enter text. | |

|  |
| --- |
| **Please comment on how criticisms made in the initial reports were resolved or reinforced by the student's performance at the oral examination and any further criticisms that arose during the examiners' discussion or in the course of the oral examination.** |
| Click here to enter text. |

**Joint recommendation**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Please indicate your joint recommendation (refer to** [**Postgraduate Assessment Regulations for Research Degrees**](http://www.ed.ac.uk/files/atoms/files/pgr_assessmentregulations.pdf)**). Please place an “x” or tick in the appropriate box.**  **Available options: a, b, f, g, i, j** | | |
| **a** | **Award PhD/Doctorate.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the award of the doctoral degree as laid down in the University’s Degree Regulations and Programmes of Study(see [www.drps.ed.ac.uk/](http://www.drps.ed.ac.uk/)) as appropriate. No further changes can be made to the thesis after examination; or |  |
| **Student Action:** finalise hard-copy thesis submission for doctorate degree  **Re-examination**: None | | |
| **b** | **Minor** **Corrections Needed.** The thesis satisfies the requirements for the award of the degree except that editorial corrections are required or stated minor weaknesses, as identified by the examiners, must be remedied. In the opinion of the examiners, the student will be able to remedy these without undertaking any further original research. The corrections to the thesis must be completed within three months and are subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Make specified corrections within three months and submit to internal examiner  **Re-examination**: Corrections to be certified by Internal Examiner(s)  Has the External Examiner requested to certify corrections? (delete as appropriate) | | YES/  NO |
| **f** | **Award MPhil.** The thesis is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the doctoral degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements; but the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Finalise hard-copy thesis submission for MPhil degree  **Re-examination**: None | | |
| **g** | **Award MPhil following Minor Corrections.** The thesis is substantially deficient in one or more of the requirements for the doctoral degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements. However, the thesis satisfies the requirements for the degree of MPhil except for stated minor corrections in the thesis. The student should be invited to carry out the specified minor corrections as indicated by the examiners. The corrections to the thesis must be completed within three months and are subject to certification by the Internal Examiner(s), and by the External Examiner (where the examiner so requests), before the degree is awarded; or |  |
| **Student Action:** Make specified corrections within three months and submit to internal examiner  **Re-examination**: Corrections to be certified by Internal Examiner(s)  Has the External Examiner requested to certify corrections? (delete as appropriate) | | YES/  NO |
| **i** | **Award MSc by Research.** The thesis is substantially deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these requirements or the requirements of the MPhil. However, the work is of sufficient quality to merit the award of MSc by Research; or |  |
| **Student Action:** None  **Re-examination**: None | | |
| **j** | **Fail.** The thesis is substantially deficient in respect of all or any of the requirements for the degree and cannot be revised to satisfy these or any other research degree requirements.  (Students failing to meet requirements following resubmission under (d), (e) or (h) may be considered for an exit award.) |  |
| **Student Action**: None  **Re-examination**: None | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of external examiner (1)** |  |
| **Signature of internal examiner (1)** |  |
| (Signature of external examiner (2)) |  |

**Specific examination critique**

**to be given to the student by the College Committee**

(to be completed including a comment on the student’s performance at the oral examination)

**Please complete the form in typescript or block capitals**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of student:** | Click here to enter text. | **UUN** | SClick here to enter text. |
| **Title of thesis:** | Click here to enter text. | | |
| **Degree sought:** | Click here to enter text. | | |

* The joint report must include any conclusions reached by the examiners as a result of the oral examination, particularly in any areas of concern identified in the individual reports.
* Where editorial corrections or modifications are required these should be specified in the joint report.
* If the thesis is considered to be substantially deficient, the report should explain the deficiencies in detail. **No further resubmission is allowed**. If the examiners recommend that no degree should be awarded, the main reasons for rejecting the thesis must be given.
* **If examiners pass information to students about recommendations they must make it clear that these are only provisional, as the final decision rests with the Examinations Committee.**

|  |
| --- |
| **Critique to the student (*The space will expand as required in the electronic version. If using paper, please continue your comments on a separate sheet.)*** |
| Click here to enter text. |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Signature of external examiner (1)** |  |
| **Signature of internal examiner (1)** |  |
| (Signature of external examiner (2)) |  |
| **Date:** | Click here to enter a date. |

**FOR COLLEGE USE ONLY**

Date received:

**Document control**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| K:\AAPS\D-AcademicAdministration\02-CodesOfPractice,Guidelines&Regulations\24-MainReferencesCopiesPolicies\01-Current\Assessment BOE SCC & Feedback\Forms\ThesisExaminerReportPtIIR | |
| If you require this document in an alternative format please email [Academic.Services@ed.ac.uk](mailto:Academic.Services@ed.ac.uk) | Date last revised:  20.06.22 |